

COMPARING THE HISTORIANS...SUMMARY

Rabbinic Civilization

Steve Gutow

December 16, 1999

This presentation compared the views in four specific works of four historians we've studied this year as well as the chapter we read last week by Isaiah Gafni in The Literature of the Sages, Part 1. The works by the other authors which are compared here are: Martin Jaffee, Early Judaism; Lawrence Schiffman, From Text to Tradition; Alan Segal, Rebecca's Children; and Shaye Cohen, From the Maccabees to the Mishnah. Since we recently read another Shaye Cohen article, "The Significance of Yavne: Pharisees, Rabbis, and the End of Jewish Sectarianism", I included its contents in the comparison.

So, what can we conclude. All of these historians place the facts on the table. They all use the same original sources: Josephus; the New Testament; and the rabbinic literature of the period of the Mishnah and the Talmud. Yet, when the sources are ambiguous or ambivalent, rational conjecture becomes the rule.

The four questions all receive different responses from each of the historians we read. When looking at the place of the rabbis during the first century of the common era, there is no contemporary history. So, what do these scholars say?

The four questions are:

1. What was the connection between the rabbis and the Pharisees?
2. Were the rabbis in control of the ritual life of the Temple in Jerusalem prior to the Temple's destruction?
3. What was the connection between the Pharisaic 'traditions' and the rabbis' 'oral law'?
4. In what ways did the destruction of the Second Temple enhance or alter the power of the rabbis during the first century of the common era?

happens to be a Reform Jew
Segal, who sees the destruction of the Temple and the ascent of the rabbis as the beginning of Judaism, surprisingly weaves a tale of Pharisaic control through all the ellipses in the historical record. Rebecca's Children suggests: 1) that the rabbis are a continuation of the Pharisees; 2) the rabbis were not in control of the Temple prior to its destruction; 3) the connection between the Pharisaic 'traditions' and the rabbis' 'oral law' is one of almost total continuity; and 4) the destruction of the Temple literally catapulted the rabbis into a position from which they could start a new religion.

happens to be a Conserv. Jew
Cohen's major purpose is to show the ways in which Judaism remained a united religion. Still, like Segal, he sees the beginning of the rabbis' control as the momentous moment in Judaism's beginning from which Judaism which could include a huge spectrum of Jewish views. 1) However, unlike Segal, he does not see the shift from Pharisee to rabbi as only a change of names. He recognizes that though there are many reasons to see that many rabbis came from Pharisaic origins, many did not. 2) Cohen does not take a stand as to which group controlled the Temple rituals, but to even imagine that the 'rabbis' were in control he would have to see them more clearly as Pharisees, and he does not. 3) Cohen sees the similarities between the traditions and the oral law but makes no direct connection, once again suggesting that the oral law came from a variety of sources. 4) Cohen sees the destruction as the opening of the rabbis' rise to power but not as a panacea to immediate hegemony. Cohen and Segal while viewing the rabbinic period as the great beginning of the Judaism we know today differ significantly in how they answer the above questions.

happens to be Orthodox
Schiffman views Judaism as one long stream beginning in the early days of the Bible and continuing until today. Surprisingly, he and Segal answer the questions very similarly. Schiffman also 1) sees the connection between the Pharisees and the rabbis as a straight-line continuation; 3) believes the oral law is a continuation of Pharisaic traditions but, equivocating, says that these traditions are never mentioned as coming from Sinai; and 4) that the power of the rabbis was enhanced geometrically after the destruction.

Q: How does Segal reconcile his views that Rabbinic J is a huge discontinuity, co-born w/ Christianity, w/ his view that Rabbis are a clear continuity of Pharisees?

1. Yavneh as an heir to teaching of Moses' time

From *Sefer Aggadah*:

294: Our masters taught: When our masters entered the vineyard at Yavneh among them were R. Judah, R. Yose, R. Nehemiah, and R. Eliezer the son of R. Yose the Galilean. In appreciation of the hospitality shown them they began their discourses by expounding relevant texts. R. Judah who was the one delegated to speak first on all occasions began his discourse on the honor due to Torah by expounding on the text: "Now Moses used to take the Tent of Meeting and pitch it without the camp" (Ex. 33:7) Have we not here he said a kol v'chomer? The Ark of the Lord was never more than 12 *mil* distant from the Israelite encampment yet the Torah speaks of those who went out as "everyone that sought the Lord went out unto the Tent of Meeting. How much more, "they who seek the Lord" applicable to disciples of the wise who go from city to city and from province to province to learn Torah!

2. Yavneh as a source for sacred learning:

From *Sefer Aggadah*:

54. As long Raban Yohanan ben Zakkai made his home in Berur Hayyil, his five disciples remained in his presence. After he passed away, four went to Yavneh. However, Eleazar ben Arakh joined his wife at Emmaus, a place of good water and beautiful situation, where he waited for the others to come to him, but they did not. When they failed to come, he wanted to go them, but his wife would not let him, saying, "Who needs whom?" He answered, "they need me." She said, "when there is a leather vessel containing food and there are mice, who goes to whom — the mice to the vessel, or the vessel to the mice?" He listened to her and remained there until he forgot his learning. After a while the other disciples came to him and asked him about a matter in Torah, but he was unable to answer.

3. Yavnean period as a time of post-prophetic wisdom, after which all is lost:

From *Sefer Aggadah*:

792: Our masters taught: When the elder Rabban Gamaliel died, the glory of Torah ceased and Levitical purity and abstinence died out. When Rabban Yohanan ben Zakkai died, the radiance of wisdom ceased. When R. Eliezer died, the Torah scroll was hidden. When R. Joshua died, counsel, speculation, and the blessing of plenty ceased in the world. When R. Ishmael ben Phiabi died, the radiance of priesthood ceased. When Rabban Gamaliel died, locusts came and tribulations increased. When R. Akiva died, the strong arms of Torah ceased, and the wells of wisdom were stopped up. When R. Eleazar ben Azariah died, the crowns of wisdom ceased, for the crowns of the sages is their wealth. When R. Hanina ben Dosa died, workers of miracles ceased. When R. Yose Ketanta died, men of piety died out. When Ben Zzai died, the assiduous students of Torah ceased. When Ben Zoma died, the expounders of Scripture ceased. When R. Meir died, the tellers of parables ceased. When Rabbi died, humility and fear of sin ceased.

4. Yavneh as a definitive source in Gemara:

B. Yevamot 42B

R. Eleazar did not go one day to the Bet Hamidrash. On meeting R. Assi he asked him, "What did the Rabbis discourse at the Bet Hamidrash?" The other replied, "Thus said R. Yohanan: The halachah is in agreement with R. Yose." — Does this then imply that only individual opinion is against him? — Yes, and so it was taught: A married woman who was always anxious to spend her time at her paternal home, or who had some angry quarrel at her husband's home, or whose husband was in prison or was old or infirm, or who was herself infirm, or had miscarried after the death of her husband, or was barren, old, a minor, incapable of conception or any other way incapacitated from procreation, must wait three months. These are the words of R. Meir. R. Judah permits immediate betrothal and marriage.

R. Hiyya b. Abba said: R. Yohana retracted. Said R. Joseph: If he retracted he did so on account of what has been taught at the Vineyard. For it was taught: R. Ishmael son of R. Yohanan b. Beroka said: I heard from the mouth of the Sages in the Vineyard of Yavneh that all women must wait three months.

12/10/99

MZ's Buddhist methodology for history

- ① The only reason to study history is to eliminate suffering.
- ② Suffering reduced as we perceive reality.
- ③ What we usually perceive as reality is an illusion.
- ④ The illusion takes place in the mind.
- ⑤ Meditation helps reduce suffering & reduce illusion.

His Q: What happens if this methodology is applied to early rabbinic texts?

Asana - Abhidharma Samuccaya
(c. 4th or 5th C. C.E., India)

What is resentment? It is not letting go of an obsession which develops through association with the anger which underlies it. Its function is to be the basis of non-endurance.

What is spite? It is a vindictive attitude preceded by indignation and resentment forming part of anger, and its function is to become the basis for harsh and strong words, to increase what is not meritorious, and not to allow one to feel happy.

What is indignation? It is a vindictive intention which is associated with anger when the chance to hurt is near at hand. Its function is to become the basis of taking hold of a knife, killing, and preparing to strike.

It is said that a mass of matter (*rūpasamudāya*) is composed of atoms (*paramāṇu*). Here the atom should be understood to be without a physical body (*nibhārīra*). The atom is determined (*vyavasāyana*) in the final analysis (*pariyantaprabheda*) by the intellect (*buddhijñā*), in view of the abandonment (*vibhāvana*) of the notion of an aggregate (*pinḍasamjñā*), and in view of the penetration into the relativity⁷⁷ of matter as a substance (*dravyapariniṣpatti-praveśa*).

The Heart Sutra (opening)

THUS have I heard. At one time the Blessed One together with many of the highest Bodhisattvas and a great company of Bhikshus was staying at Rajagaha on Mt. Gridhrakuta. The Blessed One was sitting apart absorbed in Samadhi and the Noble Avalokitesvara was meditating on the profound Prajna-paramita. The Venerable Sariputra, influenced by the Blessed One absorbed in Samadhi, spoke thus to the Noble Bodhisattva Avalokitesvara:—If a son or daughter wishes to study the profound Prajna-paramita, how is he to do so?

MZ presentation 1-16-199
Lama Taranatha, History of
(Tibet) Buddhism in India (1608)

The clear exposition of how the precious gem of the True Doctrine—the glorious, the magnificent and the source of all glories—was spread in India (*ārya-deśa*), [is briefly] called the *dgos-'dod-kun-'byuñ*.¹

[BENEDICTORY VERSE]

Salutation to the Buddha and the Bodhisattvas along with their disciples. Salutation to the Greatest Sage (*munindra*), who descends from the *dharmadhātu*² by the heavenly path and who—like the Lord of Clouds (*meghendra*)—decorated with the multi-coloured rainbow of *lakṣaṇa-s*³ and *vyāñjana-s*⁴, showers the rain of nectar in the form of holy deeds.

Shortly after the period of king Mahāpadma, Candrarakṣita²⁵ became the king of *Oḍiśa. It is said that *ārya Mañjuśrī* came to his house in the guise of a monk, preached some Mahāyāna doctrines and left a book there. According to the followers of the *sūtra*,²⁶ it was the *Prajñā-pāramitā-aṣṭa-sāhasrikā*.²⁷ According to the followers of *tantra*, it was the *Tattva-saṃgraha*.²⁸ However, the point is not of major significance, though in my opinion the former view is right. This was the first appearance of the Mahāyāna in the human world after the Teacher's *nirvāṇa*. [Fol 31A].

The controversies subsided at the Third Council, when all those belonging to the eighteen sects jointly purified the Law and codified the *Vinaya*. Also those portions of the *Sūtra-piṭaka* and the *Abhidharma* which were not codified before received codification and those portions which were already codified were revised.²¹

During the time of all these, some of the Mahāyāna scriptures reached the human world. A few monks who attained the *anupattikadharmakṣānti*²² stage preached these a little. However, since this did not become very extensive, the *śrāvaka-s* did not contest it.

The elder in his turn became possessed of the intention of propagating the Doctrine, after having secured the help of Maitreya. In order to propitiate (the latter) he took up his abode in the cave of the mountain Kukkuṭapādaparvata. For 3 years he made his propitiation, but as he did not see the slightest sign of success, he was greatly disappointed. Having gone out, he saw an old man who was making needles out of a pole of iron by rubbing it with a piece of cotton. How have the needles been produced? — asked he. The old man replied: —

-If a man possessed of moral strength

Wishes to accomplish something,

He never meets with failure,

However difficult the work may be.

If he does not lose his patience,

He can break mountains with the palm of his hand.

Accordingly, (Asaṅga) continued his propitiation for another 6 years, and thus spent altogether 9 years (in his meditation). Then he went out and saw how a rock was gradually destroyed by drops of water and by the wings of birds (that constantly touched it in their flight). But, after he had propitiated for 12 years and saw no sign (of success) he became full of grief and went out again. As he was about to go away, he saw a dog; the lower part of its body was eaten by worms, but the upper part (was still free) and it was barking and biting. (Asaṅga) became full of Commiseration and, seeing that if he were to remove the worms, the latter would perish and if not, — the dog would die, he became resolved to cut flesh from his body and remove (the worms) by attracting them with it. Accordingly, he went to the town called Acinta and, having pledged his mendicant's staff, obtained a golden knife. (With this) he cut off flesh from his body. Then, thinking that if he would take (the worms) with his hand, they would nevertheless perish, he shut his eyes and was about to take them off with his tongue. (At that moment) the dog disappeared, and he beheld Maitreya, full of light. (And thus did he address him): —

I tried to propitiate (thee), but not even a sign did appear. Scant is therefore thy Commiseration. — In such a way did he reproach (Maitreya). The Venerable One said: — I was here from the very beginning, but thou couldst not see me, owing to thy own obscurations. Now, as great Commiseration has become originated in thee, thou hast got purified and canst now behold me. (In order to see) that this is really so, raise me up on thy shoulder and show me (to the people). — Asaṅga did so, and as Maitreya could not be perceived (by anyone else, Asaṅga) believed (that his words were true).

Now, what is thy desire? — (asked Maitreya). Asaṅga replied: — I am searching for instructions, how to expound the Mahāyānistic Doctrine. — Then take hold of my robes, — said (Maitreya) and they rose up to the Tūṣita heavens.

Accordingly he listened to (the exposition of) the Prajñāpāramitā-sūtras, the great *Yogacaryā-bhūmi*, and numerous Mahāyānistic Sūtras. Then he prayed (Maitreya) to compose a treatise elucidating the meaning of these texts and, as a consequence, the 5 works of Maitreya were delivered to him. Such was the state of things according to the teacher Haribhadra and others. In the *Marmakaumudī* we read: — After the (Mahāyānistic) Scripture had been rehearsed, (there were topics) contained in it, which were of exclusively profound meaning and exceedingly hard to apprehend. As there was no possibility of understanding (these subjects), the Saint Maitreya, guided by mercy, in order to make them intelligible, has elucidated them by means of the *Abhisamayālaṅkāra-kārikā-ṣāstra*. There are some who say that Maitreya has composed (this treatise) later at the request of Āryaśaṅga. Others say that Haribhadra and the rest commit an error in affirming this, and that it was communicated (to Asaṅga) after having been composed before. This opinion of the others (we do not share).

Moreover, some consider that [116 b.] according to the point of view of the teacher Ratnākaraṇṭhi, the *Abhidharmasamuccaya*

was likewise composed by Maitreya. However we follow the usual tradition, viz. that Maitreya is the author only of the 5 treatises bearing his name.

Bu-ston Rinpoche, History of Buddhism, Part 2 pp. 137-140
(1290-1364, Tibet)

PROPHECIES OF THE MESSIAH FULFILLED IN JESUS CHRIST

Presented Here in Their Order of Fulfillment

PROPHETIC SCRIPTURE	SUBJECT	FULFILLED
<i>Gen. 3:15, p. 7</i> "I will put enmity between you and woman, and between your seed and her seed; He shall bruise your head, and you shall bruise His heel."	seed of a woman	<i>Gal. 4:4, p. 1189</i> "But when the fullness of the time had come, God sent forth His Son, born of a woman, born under the law,"
<i>Gen. 12:3, p. 14</i> "I will bless those who bless you, and I will curse him who curses you; And in you the families of the earth shall be blessed."	descendant of Abraham	<i>Matt. 1:1, p. 973</i> "The book of the genealogy of Jesus Christ, the Son of David, the Son of Abraham:"
<i>Gen. 17:19, p. 18</i> "Then God said, 'No, Sarah your wife shall bear you a son, and you shall call his name Isaac; I will establish My covenant with him for an everlasting covenant, and with his descendants after him.'"	descendant of Isaac	<i>Luke 3:34, p. 1040</i> "the son of Jacob, the son of Isaac, the son of Abraham, the son of Terah, the son of Nahor;"
<i>Nam. 24:17, p. 157</i> "I see Him, but not now; I behold Him, but not near; a Star shall come out of Jacob; Scepter shall rise out of Israel, and batter the brow of Moab, and destroy all the sons of tumult."	descendant of Jacob	<i>Matt. 1:2, p. 973</i> "Abraham begot Isaac, Isaac begot Jacob, and Jacob begot Judah and his brothers."
<i>Gen. 49:10, p. 50</i> "The scepter shall not depart from Judah, nor a lawgiver from between his feet, until Shiloh comes; and to Him shall be the obedience of the people."	from the tribe of Judah	<i>Luke 3:33, p. 1040</i> "the son of Amminadab, the son of Ram, the son of Hezron, the son of Perez, the son of Judah."
<i>Is. 9:7, p. 687</i> "Of the increase of His government and peace there will be no end, upon the throne of David and over His kingdom, to order it and establish it with judgment and justice from that time forward, even forever. The zeal of the LORD of hosts will perform this."	heir to the throne of David	<i>Luke 1:32, 33, p. 1037</i> "He will be great, and will be called the Son of the Highest; and the Lord God will give Him the throne of His father David. And He will reign over the house of Jacob forever, and of His kingdom there will be no end."
<i>Psa. 45:6, 7; 102:25-27, p. 565</i> "Your throne, O God, is forever and ever; a scepter of righteousness is the scepter of Your kingdom. You love righteousness and hate wickedness; therefore God, Your God, has anointed You with the oil of gladness more than Your companions." "Of old You laid the foundation of the earth, and the heavens are the work of Your hands. They will perish, but You will endure; yes, all of them will grow old like a garment; like a cloak You will change them, and they will be changed. But You are the same, and Your years will have no end."	anointed and eternal	<i>Heb. 1:8-12, p. 1248</i> "But to the Son He says: 'Your throne, O God, is forever and ever; a scepter of righteousness is the scepter of Your kingdom. You have loved righteousness and hated lawlessness; therefore God, Your God, has anointed You with the oil of gladness more than Your companions.' And: 'You, LORD, in the beginning laid the foundation of the earth, and the heavens are the work of Your hands; they will perish, but You remain; and they will all grow old like a garment; like a cloak You will fold them up, and they will be changed. But You are the same, and Your years will not fail.'"

PROPHETIC SCRIPTURE	SUBJECT	FULFILLED
<p><i>Mic. 5:2, p. 925</i> <i>"But you, Bethlehem, Ephrathah, though you are little among the thousands of Judah, yet out of you shall come forth to Me the One to be ruler in Israel, whose goings forth have been from of old, from everlasting."</i></p>	born in Bethlehem	<p><i>Luke 2:4, 5, 7, p. 1038</i> <i>"And Joseph also went up from Galilee out of the city of Nazareth, into Judea, the city of David, which is called Bethlehem, because he was of the house lineage of David, to be registered. Mary, his betrothed wife, who was child. . . . And she brought forth her firstborn Son, and wrapped Him in swaddling cloths, and laid Him in a manger, because there was no room for them in the inn."</i></p>
<p><i>Dan. 9:25, p. 879</i> <i>"Know therefore and understand, that from the going forth of the command to restore and build Jerusalem until Messiah the Prince, there shall be seven weeks and sixty-two weeks; the street shall be built again, and the wall, even in troublesome times."</i></p>	time for His birth	<p><i>Luke 2:1, 2, p. 1038</i> <i>"And it came to pass in those days that a decree went out from Caesar Augustus that all the world should be registered. This census first took place while Quirinius governing Syria."</i></p>
<p><i>Is. 7:14, p. 685</i> <i>"Therefore the Lord Himself will give you a sign: Behold, the virgin shall conceive and bear a Son, and shall call His name Immanuel."</i></p>	to be born of a virgin	<p><i>Luke 1:26, 27, 30, 31, p. 1036</i> <i>"Now in the sixth month the angel Gabriel was sent by God to a city of Galilee named Nazareth, to a virgin betrothed to a man whose name was Joseph, of the house of David. The virgin's name was Mary. Then the angel said to her, 'Do not be afraid, Mary, for you have found favor with God. And behold, you will conceive in your womb and bring forth a Son, and shall call His name JESUS.'"</i></p>
<p><i>Jer. 31:15, p. 776</i> <i>"Thus says the LORD: A voice was heard in Ramah, lamentation and bitter weeping, Rachel weeping for her children, refusing to be comforted for her children, because they are no more."</i></p>	slaughter of children	<p><i>Matt. 2:16-18, p. 974</i> <i>"Then Herod, when he saw that he was deceived by the wise men, was exceedingly angry; and he sent forth and put to death all the male children who were in Bethlehem and in all its districts, from two years and under, according to the time which he had determined from the wise men. This was fulfilled what was spoken by the prophet, saying: A voice was heard in Ramah, lamentation, weeping, and mourning, Rachel weeping for her children, refusing to be comforted, because they were no more."</i></p>
<p><i>Hos. 11:1, p. 892</i> <i>"When Israel was a child, I loved him, and out of Egypt I called My son."</i></p>	flight to Egypt	<p><i>Matt. 2:14, 15, p. 974</i> <i>"When he arose, he took the Child and His mother by night and departed for Egypt, and was there until the death of Herod, that it might be fulfilled which was spoken by the Lord through the prophet, saying, 'Out of Egypt I called My Son.'"</i></p>
<p><i>Is. 40:3-5, p. 713</i> <i>"The voice of one crying in the wilderness: 'Prepare the way of the LORD; make straight in the desert a highway for our God. Every valley shall be exalted, and every mountain and hill shall be made low; the crooked places shall be made straight, and the rough places smooth; the glory of the LORD shall be revealed, and all flesh shall see it together; for the mouth of the LORD has spoken.'"</i></p>	the way prepared	<p><i>Luke 3:3-6, p. 1039</i> <i>"And he went into all the region about the Jordan, preaching a baptism of repentance for the remission of sins, as it is written in the book of the words of the prophet, saying: 'The voice of one crying in the wilderness: "Prepare the way of the LORD, make His paths straight. Every valley shall be filled and every hill brought low; and the crooked shall be made straight, and the rough shall be made smooth; and all flesh shall see the salvation of God.'"</i></p>

PROPHETIC SCRIPTURE	SUBJECT	FULFILLED
Malachi 3:1-6 p. 964 Behold, I send My messenger, and he will prepare the way before Me. And the Lord whom you seek, will suddenly come to you, even the messenger of the covenant, in whom you delight. Behold, He is coming, says the LORD of hosts."	preceded by a forerunner	Luke 7:24, 27, p. 1046 "When the messengers of John had departed, He began to speak to the multitudes concerning John: 'What did you go out into the wilderness to see? A reed shaken by the wind? . . . This is he of whom it is written: <i>'Behold, I send My messenger before Your face, who will prepare Your way before You.'</i> "
Malachi 3:1-6 p. 965 Behold, I will send you Elijah the prophet before the coming of the great and terrible day of the LORD. And he will turn the hearts of the fathers to the children, and the hearts of the children to their fathers, so that I will not come and strike the earth with a curse."	preceded by Elijah	Matt. 11:13, 14, p. 984 "For all the prophets and the law prophesied until John. And if you are willing to receive it, he is Elijah who is to come."
Malachi 3:1-6 p. 966 I will declare the decree: the LORD has said to Me, "You are My Son, today I have begotten You."	declared the Son of God	Matt. 3:17, p. 975 "And suddenly a voice came from heaven, saying, 'This is My beloved Son, in whom I am well pleased.'"
Malachi 3:1-6 p. 966 Nevertheless the gloom will not be perpetual for her who is distressed, as when at first they lightly esteemed the land of Zebulun and the land of Naphtali, and afterward they have heavily oppressed her, by the way of the sea, beyond the Jordan, in Galilee of the Gentiles. The people who walked in darkness have seen a great light; those who sat in the land of the shadow of death, upon them a light has shined."	Galilean ministry	Matt. 4:13-16, p. 976 "And leaving Nazareth, He came and dwelt in Capernaum, which is by the sea, in the regions of Zebulun and Naphtali, that it might be fulfilled which was spoken by Isaiah the prophet, saying: <i>'The land of Zebulun and the land of Naphtali, the way of the sea, beyond the Jordan, Galilee of the Gentiles: The people who sat in darkness saw a great light, and upon those who sat in the region and shadow of death light has dawned.'</i> "
Malachi 3:1-6 p. 967 I will open my mouth in a parable; I will utter dark sayings of old, which we have hid and known, and our fathers have told us, saying, 'We will not hide them from their children, telling to the generation to come the praises of the LORD, and His strength and His wonderful works that He has done.'"	speaks in parables	Matt. 13:34, 35, p. 987 "All these things Jesus spoke to the multitude in parables; and without a parable He did not speak to them that it might be fulfilled which was spoken by the prophet, saying: <i>'I will open My mouth in parables; I will utter things which have been kept secret from the foundation of the world.'</i> "
Malachi 3:1-6 p. 991 The LORD your God will raise up for you a Prophet like me from your midst, from your brethren. Him you shall hear."	a prophet	Acts 3:20, 22, p. 1108 "And that He may send Jesus Christ, who was preached to you before, . . . For Moses truly said to the fathers, <i>'The LORD your God will raise up for you a Prophet like me from your brethren. Him you shall hear in all things, whatever He says to you.'</i> "
Malachi 3:1-6 p. 794 The Spirit of the Lord GOD is upon Me, because the LORD has anointed Me to preach good tidings to the poor; He has sent Me to heal the brokenhearted, to proclaim liberty to the captives, and the opening of the prison to those who are bound; to proclaim the acceptable year of the LORD, and the day of vengeance of our God; to comfort all who mourn."	to bind up the brokenhearted	Luke 4:18, 19, p. 1041 "The Spirit of the LORD is upon Me, because He has anointed Me to preach the gospel to the poor. He has sent Me to heal the brokenhearted, to preach deliverance to the captives and recovery of sight to the blind, to set at liberty those who are oppressed, to preach the acceptable year of the LORD."
Malachi 3:1-6 p. 727 He is despised and rejected by men, a man of sorrows and acquainted with grief. And we hid, as it were, our faces from Him; He was despised, and we did not esteem Him."	rejected by His own people, the Jews	John 1:11, p. 1075 "He came to His own, and His own did not receive Him." Luke 23:18, p. 1068 "And they all cried out at once, saying, 'Away with this Man, and release to us Barabbas'"

PROPHETIC SCRIPTURE	SUBJECT	FULFILLED
<p><i>Ps. 110:4, p. 602</i> "The LORD has sworn and will not relent, 'You are a priest forever according to the order of Melchizedek.'"</p>	priest after order of Melchizedek	<p><i>Heb. 5:5, 6, p. 1250</i> "So also Christ did not glorify Himself become High Priest, but it was He who said to Him: 'You are My Son, today I have begotten You.' As He also says in another place: 'You are a priest forever according to the order of Melchizedek.'"</p>
<p><i>Zech. 9:9, p. 955</i> "Rejoice greatly, O daughter of Zion! Shout, O daughter of Jerusalem! Behold, your King is coming to you; He is just and having salvation, lowly and riding on a donkey, a colt, the foal of a donkey."</p>	triumphal entry	<p><i>Mark 11:7, 9, 11, p. 1023</i> "Then they brought the colt to Jesus and threw their garments on it, and He sat on it. . . . Then those who went before and those who followed cried out, saying: 'Hosanna! Blessed is He who comes in the name of the Lord!' . . . And Jesus went into Jerusalem and into the temple. So when He had looked around at all things, as the hour was already late, He went out to Bethany with the twelve."</p>
<p><i>Ps. 8:2, p. 544</i> "Out of the mouth of babes and infants You have ordained strength, because of Your enemies, that You may silence the enemy and the avenger."</p>	adored by infants	<p><i>Matt. 21:15, 16, p. 995</i> "But when the chief priests and scribes saw the wonderful things that He did, they did not say, 'Hosanna to the Son of David,' but they were indignant and said to Him, 'Hear what these are saying?' And He said to them, 'Yes. Have you never read, "The mouth of babes and nursing infants have perfected praise?"'</p>
<p><i>Is. 53:1, p. 727</i> "Who has believed our report? And to whom has the arm of the LORD been revealed?"</p>	not believed	<p><i>John 12:37, 38, p. 1091</i> "But although He had done signs before them, they did not believe in Him, that the word of Isaiah might be fulfilled, which he said, 'who has believed our report? and to whom has the arm of the LORD been revealed?'"</p>
<p><i>Ps. 41:9, p. 563</i> "Even my own familiar friend in whom I trusted, who ate my bread, has lifted up his heel against me."</p>	betrayed by a close friend	<p><i>Luke 22:47, 48, p. 1067</i> "And while He was still holding a multitude; and he, Judas, one of the twelve, came and drew near to Jesus. Jesus said to him, 'Judas, the Son of Man with a kiss?'"</p>
<p><i>Zech. 11:12, p. 957</i> "Then I said to them, 'If it is agreeable to you, give me my wages; and if not, refrain.' So they weighed out for my wages thirty pieces of silver."</p>	betrayed for thirty pieces of silver	<p><i>Matt. 26:14, 15, p. 1002</i> "Then one of the twelve, Judas Iscariot, went to the chief priests, saying, 'What are you willing to give me if I betray Him to you?' And they gave him thirty pieces of silver."</p>
<p><i>Ps. 35:11, p. 558</i> "Fierce witnesses rise up; they ask me things that I do not know."</p>	accused by false witnesses	<p><i>Mark 14:57, 58, p. 1000</i> "And some rose up and testified against Him, saying, 'We heard Him say, "I will destroy this temple, and within three days I will build it up." Another made a false witness against Him, saying, "I heard Him say, "I am the Son of God."'"</p>
<p><i>Is. 53:7, p. 727</i> "He was oppressed and He was afflicted, yet He opened not His mouth; He was led as a lamb to the slaughter; and as a sheep before its shearers is silent, so He opened not His mouth."</p>	silent to accusations	<p><i>Mark 15:4, 5, p. 1010</i> "Then Pilate said to Him, 'Do You answer anything to these things they say?' But He still answered nothing, so that Pilate was amazed."</p>

PROPHETIC SCRIPTURE	SUBJECT	FULFILLED
<p>15:8, p. 725 My back to those who struck Me, My cheeks to those who plucked out Me; I did not hide My face from them, and spitting."</p>	spat on and struck	<p>Matt. 26:67, p. 1003 "Then they spat in His face and beat Him; and others struck Him with the palms of their hands."</p>
<p>35:19, p. 558 them not rejoice over me who are fully my enemies; nor let them wink the eye who hate me without a cause."</p>	hated without reason	<p>John 15:24, 25, p. 1094 "If I had not done among them the works which no one else did, they would have no sin; but now they have seen and also hated both Me and My Father. But <i>this happened</i> that the word might be fulfilled which is written in their law, 'They hated Me without a cause.'"</p>
<p>53:3, p. 727 He was wounded for our transgressions; He was bruised for our iniquities; the punishment for our peace was upon Him, by His stripes we are healed."</p>	vicarious sacrifice	<p>Rom. 5:6, 8, p. 1145 "For when we were still without strength, in due time Christ died for the ungodly. . . . But God demonstrates His own love toward us, in that while we were still sinners, Christ died for us."</p>
<p>12:10, p. 727 therefore I will divide Him a portion with the great, and He shall divide the spoil with the strong, because He poured out His soul unto death, and He was numbered with the transgressors, and He bore the sin of many, and made intercession for the transgressors."</p>	crucified with malefactors	<p>Mark 15:27, 28, p. 1030 "With Him they also crucified two robbers, one on His right and the other on His left. So the Scripture was fulfilled which says, 'And He was numbered with the transgressors.'"</p>
<p>12:10, p. 957 and I will pour on the house of David and on the inhabitants of Jerusalem the spirit of grace and supplication; then they shall say, 'Me whom they have pierced; and we will mourn for Him as one mourns for his only son, and will weep bitterly for Him as one weeps for a firstborn.'"</p>	pierced through hands and feet	<p>John 20:27, p. 1099 "Then He said to Thomas, 'Reach your finger here, and look at My hands; and reach your hand here, and put it into My side. Do not be unbelieving, but believing.'"</p>
<p>2:7, 8, p. 551 those who see Me laugh Me to scorn; they shoot out the lip, they shake the head, saying, 'He trusted in the LORD, let Him deliver Him; let Him deliver Him, since He trusts in Him!'"</p>	sneered and mocked	<p>Luke 23:35, p. 1068 "And the people stood looking on. But even the rulers with them sneered, saying, 'He saved others; let Him save Himself if He is the Christ, the chosen of God.'"</p>
<p>69:9, p. 576 because zeal for Your house has eaten up, and the reproaches of those who hate You have fallen on me."</p>	was reproached	<p>Rom. 15:3, p. 1154 "For even Christ did not please Himself; but as it is written, 'The reproaches of those who reproached You fell on Me.'"</p>
<p>109:4, p. 601 return for my love they are my accusers, but I give myself to prayer."</p>	prayer for His enemies	<p>Luke 23:34, p. 1068 "Then Jesus said, 'Father, forgive them, for they do not know what they do.' And they divided His garments and cast lots."</p>
<p>22:17, 18, p. 551 can count all My bones. They look and stare at Me. They divide My garments among them, and for My clothing they cast lots."</p>	soldiers gambled for His clothing	<p>Matt. 27:35, 36, p. 1005 "Then they crucified Him, and divided His garments, casting lots, that it might be fulfilled which was spoken by the prophet: 'They divided My garments among them, and for My clothing they cast lots.' Sitting down, they kept watch over Him there."</p>
<p>22:1, p. 550 My God, My God, why have You forsaken Me? Why are You so far from helping Me, and from the words of My groaning?"</p>	forsaken by God	<p>Matt. 27:46, p. 1005 "And about the ninth hour Jesus cried out with a loud voice, saying, 'Eli, Eli, lama sabachthani?' that is, 'My God, My God, why have You forsaken Me?'"</p>

PROPHETIC SCRIPTURE	SUBJECT	FULFILLED
<p><i>Ps. 34:20, p. 558</i> "He guards all his bones; not one of them is broken."</p>	no bones broken	<p><i>John 19:32, 33, 36, p. 1098</i> "Then the soldiers came and broke legs of the first and of the other who crucified with Him. But when they came to Jesus and saw that He was already dead, they did not break His legs. . . . For the things were done that the Scripture should be fulfilled, 'Not one of His bones shall be broken.'"</p>
<p><i>Zech. 12:10, p. 957</i> "And I will pour on the house of David and on the inhabitants of Jerusalem the Spirit of grace and supplication; then they will look on Me whom they have pierced; they will mourn for Him as one mourns for his only son, and grieve for Him as one grieves for a firstborn."</p>	His side pierced	<p><i>John 19:34, p. 1098</i> "But one of the soldiers pierced His side with a spear, and immediately blood and water came out."</p>
<p><i>Is. 53:9, p. 727</i> "And they made His grave with the wicked—but with the rich at His death, because He had done no violence, nor was any deceit in His mouth."</p>	buried with the rich	<p><i>Matt. 27:57-60, p. 1005</i> "Now when evening had come, there came a rich man from Arimathea, named Joseph, who himself had also become a disciple of Jesus. This man went to Pilate and asked for the body of Jesus. Then he commanded the body to be given to him. And when Joseph had taken the body, he wrapped it in a clean linen cloth, and he laid it in his new tomb which he had hewn in the rock; and he rolled a large stone away from the door of the tomb, and departed."</p>
<p><i>Ps. 16:10, p. 547</i> "For You will not leave my soul in Sheol, nor will You allow Your Holy One to see corruption."</p> <p><i>Ps. 49:15, p. 567</i> "But God will redeem my soul from the power of the grave; for He shall receive me. Selah"</p>	to be resurrected	<p><i>Mark 16:6, 7, p. 1031</i> "But he said to them, 'Do not be alarmed. You seek Jesus of Nazareth, who was crucified. He is risen! He is not here. See the place where they laid Him. Go and tell His disciples—and Peter. He is going before you into Galilee. You will see Him, as He said to you.'"</p>
<p><i>Ps. 68:18, p. 575</i> "You have ascended on high, You have led captivity captive; You have received gifts among men; even among the rebellious, that the Lord God might dwell there."</p>	His ascension to God's right hand	<p><i>Mark 16:19, p. 1031</i> "So then after the Lord had said these things to them, He was received up into heaven and sat down at the right hand of God."</p> <p><i>1 Cor. 15:4, p. 1170</i> "And that He was buried, and rose again the third day, according to the Scriptures."</p> <p><i>Eph. 4:8, p. 1197</i> "Therefore He says: 'When He ascended on high, He led captivity captive, and gave gifts to men.'"</p>

Rabbi Leonard Gordon

Sources for: The Multiple Meanings of Hannukah

1. Roman edict of 9 b.c.e.

note // to
language
of NT

Whereas the Providence which has guided our whole existence and which has shown such care and liberality, has brought our life to the peak of perfection in giving to us Augustus Caesar, whom it (Providence) filled with virtue (*aretē*) for the welfare of mankind, and who, being sent to us and to our descendants as a savior (*sōtēr*), has put an end to war and has set all things in order; and whereas, having become visible (*phaneis*, i.e., now that a God has become visible), Caesar has fulfilled the hopes of all earlier times . . . not only in surpassing all the benefactors (*euergetai*) who preceded him but also in leaving to his successors no hope of surpassing him; and whereas, finally, that the birthday of the God (viz., Caesar Augustus) has been for the whole world the beginning of the gospel (*euangelion*) concerning him, (therefore, let all reckon a new era beginning from the date of his birth, and let his birthday mark the beginning of the new year).¹

2. from The Golden Bough

What considerations led the ecclesiastical authorities to institute the festival of Christmas? The motives for the innovation are stated with great frankness by a Syrian writer, himself a Christian. 'The reason,' he tells us, 'why the fathers transferred the celebration of the sixth of January to the twenty-fifth of December was this. It was a custom of the heathen to celebrate on the same twenty-fifth of December the birthday of the Sun, at which they kindled lights in token of festivity. In these solemnities and festivities the Christians also took part. Accordingly when the doctors of the Church perceived that the Christians had a leaning to this festival, they took counsel and resolved that the true Nativity should be solemnised on that day and the festival of the Epiphany on the sixth of January. Accordingly, along with this custom, the practice has prevailed of kindling fires till the sixth.'

3. Celsus

"If you Christians believe the stories of Jesus miracles, if you believe the story of Jesus' miraculous birth, if you believe the story that Jesus was raised from the dead and ascended into Heaven, then how can you refuse to believe precisely the same stories when they are told of the other Savior Gods: Herakles, Asklepios, the Dioscuri, Dionysos, and a dozen others I could name?"

4. Justin Martyr late 2nd Cent. CE

ie. don't make
fun of us, you
Romans, we're not
freaks.

When we say that the Word (*logos*), who is the first-born of God, was born for us without sexual union . . . and that he was crucified and died and after rising again ascended into Heaven, we introduce nothing new beyond (what you say) regarding those whom you call sons of Zeus.⁸ . . . When we say that Jesus was born of a virgin, you should consider this something in common with Perseus. When we say that he healed the lame, the paralyzed, and those born blind, and raised the dead, we seem to be talking about things like those said to have been done by Asklepios.⁹

1. From: I Maccabees, Chapter 4

JUDAH AND HIS BROTHERS SAID: "Now that our enemies are crushed, let us go up to purify and dedicate the sanctuary."....

....On the twenty-fifth day of the ninth month, that is the month of Kislev, in the one hundred and forty-ninth year, they arose early and offered sacrifice according to the Law upon the new altar of burnt offering which they had made. At the same time and on the same day on which the heathen had profaned it, on that very day it was consecrated with songs and harps and lutes and cymbals. All the people fell on their faces and prostrated themselves, and uttered praises to Heaven who had caused them to prosper. They celebrated the dedication of the altar for eight days, brought burnt offerings with joy, and offered a sacrifice of deliverance and praise.....Thus there was great joy among the people and the reproach caused by the heathen was removed. Judah and his brothers and the entire congregation of Israel decreed that the days of the dedication of the altar should be kept with gladness and joy at their due season, year after year, for eight days from the twenty-fifth of the month of Kislev.

An 8-day festival in 25th of the Month, as in Roman Saturnalia & X-mas.

2. From: I Maccabees, 1:11-13

In those days lawless men came forth from Israel, and misled many, saying, "Let us go and make a covenant with the Gentiles round about us, for since we separated from them many evils have come upon us." This proposal pleased them, and some of the people eagerly went to the King. He authorized them to observe the ordinances of the Gentiles.

by this account, we see Hellenizing Jews instigating the cultural changes

3. From: II Maccabees, I

THE JEWISH BRETHREN IN JERUSALEM and those in the land of Judea, To their Jewish brethren in Egypt, Greeting and good peace.

....In the reign of Demetrius, in the one hundred and sixty-ninth year, we Jews wrote to you, in the critical distress which came upon us in those years after Jason and his company revolted from the holy land and the kingdom and burned the gate and shed innocent blood. We besought the Lord and we were heard, and we offered sacrifice and cereal offering, and we lighted the lamps and we set out the loaves. And now see that you keep the feast of booths in the month of Kislev, in the one hundred and eighty-eighth year.

note: the villain here is Jason, a Jewish reformer

because Sukkot was a dedication festival

As we are about to celebrate the purification of the temple, on the twenty-fifth day of the month of Kislev, we think it necessary to inform you, so that you too may observe the Camping Out festival and the kindling of the fire, when Nehemiah, who built the temple and the altar, offered sacrifices. For when our forefathers were being taken to Persia, the pious priests of that day took some of the fire on the altar and hid it secretly

in the hollow of an empty cistern, where they made it secure, so that the place was unknown to anyone. Many years after, when it pleased God, Nehemiah was commissioned by the king of Persia, and sent the descendants of the priests who had hidden the fire to get it. But when they reported to us that they could not find any fire but only muddy water, he ordered them to dip some out and bring it to him. And when the things to be sacrificed had been put in place, Nehemiah ordered the priests to sprinkle the water on the wood and the things that were laid on it. And when this was done and some time had passed, and the sun, which had been clouded over, shone out, a great blaze was kindled, so that they all wondered. And the priests uttered a prayer while the sacrifice was being consumed -- the priests and all present, Jonathan leading and the rest responding, as Nehemiah did.

....Then the priests struck up the hymns. And when the things that were sacrificed were consumed, Nehemiah ordered them to pour the water that was left on large stones. And when this was done, a flame was kindled, but when the light shone back from the altar, it went out. And when the thing became known, and the king of Persia was told that in the place where the priests that were deported had hidden the fire, water had appeared, and with it Nehemiah's people had burned up the things they sacrificed, the king, after investigating the matter, made the place a sacred inclosure, and the king exchanged many different gifts with his favorites. Nehemiah's people called this Nephthar, which is translated "Purification," but most people call it Nephthai.

4. From: I Kings 8:1-3
Dedication of the First Temple

Then Solomon assembled the elders of Israel and all the heads of the tribes, the leaders of the fathers' houses of the people of Israel, before King Solomon in Jerusalem, to bring up the ark of the covenant of the Lord out of the city of David, which is Zion. And all the men of Israel assembled to King Solomon at the feast in the month of Eth'anim, which is the seventh month. And all the elders of Israel came, and the priests took up the ark.

5. From: Nehemiah 8:1-3, 14-18
Dedication of the Second Temple

And when the seventh month had come, the children of Israel were in their towns. And all the people gathered as one man into the square before the Water Gate; and they told Ezra the scribe to bring the book of the law of Moses which the Lord had given to Israel. And Ezra the priest brought the law before the assembly, both men and women and all who could hear with understanding, on the first day of the seventh month. And he read from it facing the square before the Water Gate from early morning until midday, in the presence of the men and women and those who could understand; and the ears of all the people were attentive to the book of the law.

....And they found it written in the law that the Lord had commanded by Moses that the people of Israel should dwell in booths during the feast of the seventh month, and that they should publish and proclaim in all

here in
II Maccabees
the reason
for this
is cited as
a miracle
that took
place back
in Nehemiah's
day involving
light & fire.

their towns and in Jerusalem, "Go out to the hills and bring branches of olive, wild olive, myrtle, palm, and other leafy trees to make booths, as it is written. So the people went out and brought them and made booths for themselves, each on his roof, and in their courts and in the courts of the house of God, and in the square at the Water Gate and in the square at the Gate of E'phraim. And all the assembly of those who had returned from the captivity made booths and dwelt in the booths; for from the days of Jeshua the son of Nun to that day the people of Israel had not done so. And there was very great rejoicing. And day by day, from the first day to the last day, he read from the book of the law of God. They kept the feast seven days; and on the eighth day there was a solemn assembly, according to the ordinance.

6. ANTIQUITIES OF THE JEWS — Josephus, Chapter VII.

(Josephus was a Jewish historian who fought against the Romans at first in the 66-70 C.E. war and later wrote many works explaining Jewish history and aspirations to the Romans.)

Josephus' message to Rome: if you leave Jews alone to follow their ancestral traditions, they'll be model citizens of the empire. And the Pharisees are the best group for Rome to empower to this.

...Now Judas celebrated the festival of the restoration of the sacrifices of the temple for eight days; and omitted no sort of pleasures thereon: but he feasted them upon very rich and splendid sacrifices; and he honoured God, and delighted them, by hymns and psalms. Nay, they were so very glad at the revival of their customs, when after a long time of intermission, they unexpectedly had regained the freedom of their worship, that they made it law for their posterity, that they should keep a festival, on account of the restoration of their temple worship, for eight days. And from that time to this we celebrate this festival, and call it Lights. I suppose the reason was because this liberty beyond our hopes appeared to us; and that thence was the name given to that festival. Judas also rebuilt the walls round about the city, and reared towers of great height against the incursions of enemies, and set guards therein. He also fortified the city Bethsurn, that it might serve as a citadel against any distresses that might come from our enemies.

7. From: SHABBATH 21-B to 22-A

(The Babylonian Talmud's account; post-Third Century)

What is [the reason of] Hanukkah? For our Rabbis taught: On the twenty-fifth of Kislev [commence] the days of Hanukkah, which are eight on which a lamentation for the dead and fasting are forbidden. For when the Greeks entered the Temple, they defiled all the oils therein, and when the Hasmonean dynasty prevailed against and defeated them, they made search and found only one cruse of oil which lay with the seal of the High Priest, but which contained sufficient for day's lighting only; yet a miracle was wrought therein and they lit [the lamp] therewith for eight days. The following year these [days] were appointed a Festival with [the recital of] Hallel and Thanksgiving.

Look at how the Rabbis negate the civil war & the greatness of the Maccabees. They just go with a purity ritual miracle that they invent.

their towns and in Jerusalem, "Go out to the hills and bring branches of olive, wild olive, myrtle, palm, and other leafy trees to make booths, as it is written. So the people went out and brought them and made booths for themselves, each on his roof, and in their courts and in the courts of the house of God, and in the square at the Water Gate and in the square at the Gate of E'phraim. And all the assembly of those who had returned from the captivity made booths and dwelt in the booths; for from the days of Jeshua the son of Nun to that day the people of Israel had not done so. And there was very great rejoicing. And day by day, from the first day to the last day, he read from the book of the law of God. They kept the feast seven days; and on the eighth day there was a solemn assembly, according to the ordinance.

6. ANTIQUITIES OF THE JEWS — Josephus, Chapter VII.

(Josephus was a Jewish historian who fought against the Romans at first in the 66-70 C.E. war and later wrote many works explaining Jewish history and aspirations to the Romans.)

....Now Judas celebrated the festival of the restoration of the sacrifices of the temple for eight days; and omitted no sort of pleasures thereon: but he feasted them upon very rich and splendid sacrifices; and he honoured God, and delighted them, by hymns and psalms. Nay, they were so very glad at the revival of their customs, when after a long time of intermission, they unexpectedly had regained the freedom of their worship, that they made it law for their posterity, that they should keep a festival, on account of the restoration of their temple worship, for eight days. And from that time to this we celebrate this festival, and call it Lights. I suppose the reason was because this liberty beyond our hopes appeared to us; and that thence was the name given to that festival. Judas also rebuilt the walls round about the city, and reared towers of great height against the incursions of enemies, and set guards therein. He also fortified the city Bethsurn, that it might serve as a citadel against any distresses that might come from our enemies.

Just trying to get back to ancestors

7. From: SHABBATH 21-B to 22-A

(The Babylonian Talmud's account; post-Third Century)

Seven Forbidden

What is [the reason of] Hanukkah? For our Rabbis taught: On the twenty-fifth of Kislev [commence] the days of Hanukkah, which are eight on which a lamentation for the dead and fasting are forbidden. For when the Greeks entered the Temple, they defiled all the oils therein, and when the Hasmonean dynasty prevailed against and defeated them, they made search and found only one cruse of oil which lay with the seal of the High Priest, but which contained sufficient for day's lighting only; yet a miracle was wrought therein and they lit [the lamp] therewith for eight days. The following year these [days] were appointed a Festival with [the recital of] Hallel and Thanksgiving.

5

(Part of the Jewish liturgy for Channukah; written after the seventh century.)

...The Hasmoneans entered the sanctuary, rebuilt the gates, closed the breaches, and cleansed the Temple court from the slain and the impurities. They looked for pure olive oil to light the Menorah, and found only one bottle with the seal of the high priest so that they were sure of its purity. Though its quantity seemed sufficient only for one day's lighting, it lasted for eight days owing to the blessing of the God of heaven who had established his name there.

....And so the Jews everywhere observe this festival for eight days, beginning on the twenty-fifth of Kislev. These days instituted by priests, Levites and sages of Temple times, shall be celebrated by their descendants forever.

